

## ***“Waves of Freedom”***

A criticism of the movie – by Yehuda Ben-Tzur & Aryeh Malkin

This title of Alan Rosenthal’s movie ‘[Waves of Freedom](#)’ sounds great but the salute is nothing but a big fizzle. The movie is based on Murray Greenfield’s version of the story of the Hagana vessel “Hatikvah”. Let us take a closer look at this salute, but before we do so may we, the authors humbly point out that Yehuda is a Palyam (the naval company of the Hagana/Palmach) veteran and was active in preparing and commanding a number of vessels of the Hagana/Mossad for Aliya Bet and Aryeh is one of those American veterans who sailed on the “Josiah Wedgwood”, the first of the Hagana vessels that sailed from the USA.

Murray and Alan et al complain that the Americans were not given enough attention or due credit for their actions. Our response is simply maybe those guys read very selectively and if they wish we shall forward them a bibliography. These actions have been published in a number of books and articles both materially and virtually.

Why is it that we have that feeling that political reasons have led Murray and Alan to practically hide the fact that these ships that left from the USA were bought by the Hagana, and the Hagana (through its arm, the Mossad for Aliya Bet) was responsible for manning them and getting them over to Europe, and preparing the ships for their special mission, and putting the survivors on those ships and getting them to Israel/Cyprus. Or ignore the fact that members of the Palyam carried out many of these activities. Yet, in their book and the abovementioned movie, one gets the impression that these macho-Americans did it all by themselves from A to Z. This is like telling the story of how Israel achieved its independence without mentioning David Ben Gurion or the Palmach!



We salute Murray and Alan for what they did, but we also demand a little modesty, courtesy and, above all, faithfulness to the true epic story of Aliya Bet. So, let it be mentioned here that the commander of “Hatikvah” was **Yisrolik Rotem** (seen here); he was assisted by **Alex Shur** and **Meir Falick**; all three bona-fide members of the Palyam. Their communications man onboard was **Nachum Manor**, himself a survivor of the Holocaust who had knowledge of Hebrew and was trained by the Hagana in Europe to be a radio operator. Without these men on their ship, and others like the Palyamniks **Yehoshua Baharav Rabinowitz** and **Avraham Zakai** who were in charge in Europe of preparing the ship for her special mission, Murray and his American friends may have still be docking at the port of Bocca di Magra, Italy, to this day.